

A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

An Autoethnodrama in Four Acts

Carl Holmgren

Luleå University of Technology

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

Abstract

This article explores three aspects of interpretation—musical interpretation of notated Western art music, hermeneutics (theoretical framework), and poetry (tool for analysis and representation)—based on ongoing music education research focusing on the learning of musical interpretation within the one-to-one context of higher music education. The broad philosophic poetic inquiry of interpretation has the form of an autoethnodrama containing both haiku and found poetry. Poetry is both used as a process of inquiry and as a means of representation. The autoethnodrama explores the author's struggle with finding his cogito for conducting arts-based research and touches upon his personal history. Through the combination of autoethnodrama and a philosophic poetic inquiry, he finds a deeper understanding of musical interpretation, usage of poetry and autoethnodrama in research, as well as of his personhood. Concluding reflections on one possible way of interpreting the autoethnodrama in relation to teaching and learning of musical interpretation within higher music education are also presented.

Keywords: Arts-based research, autoethnodrama, interpretation, musical interpretation, hermeneutics, poetry, poetic inquiry, translation, Western art music, philosophy of science, ELIZA.

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

A Philosophical Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

An Autoethnodrama in Four Acts

Carl Holmgren¹

PROLOGUE

Where the disposition of the autoethnodrama, its dramatis personae, and some important preliminaries are presented.

SCENE 1

NARRATOR. The dramatis personae for the following autoethnodrama in four acts including prologue and epilogue, divided in scenes, consists of Carl Holmgren

Luleå University of Technology. E-mail: carl.holmgren@ltu.se

An ethnodrama is the written dramatic script resulting from transforming and adapting ethnographic research data (Saldaña 2008, 283). Although ethnodrama's status as research is still questioned, the commercial theatre has staged ethnodramatic works since the 1980s (Saldaña 2008, 284). In this article, autoethnodrama refers to the written script of an ethnodrama based on the author's experiences. Furthermore, the present drama is part fact and part fiction.

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

(henceforth abbreviated to CH), Interpretation, and some other rather self-invited characters including philosophers on the topics of hermeneutics, musical interpretation, and poetry.³ The concept of musical interpretation is viewed as a form of "oral recitation" (seen in a widened perspective), hermeneutics as a form of developing a "reasonable explanation", and creation of poems as a form of "translation from another language".^{4,5}

N.B. This script, constituting the lion's share of this article, is not primarily intended to be performed, i.e., it is a "closet drama" somewhat akin to the concept of Augenmusik. Its sources are CH's own experiences of and reflections on musical interpretation and research; literature including philosophy, earlier research, and poetry; and transcripts from qualitative interviews conducted by CH with four piano teachers and six students within higher music education in the Western art music tradition in Sweden.⁷

The utterances are either in the form of prose sentences or of one of three types of poems. The prose sentences are written by CH if no reference is given. The poems are written by CH and either constructed (1) using the literary practice of found poetry, 8 (2) as a representation of interview material from the

³ Important influences and forerunners for writing this drama are presented in act IV.

⁴ Palmer 1972, 14

Within the scope of this autoethnodrama and the concluding reflections, I have—for visuo-poetic reasons—placed the references in footnotes (using the same format as would otherwise have been placed in parenthesis) analogously with the practice of APA for footnotes.

⁶ Saldaña 2005, 14

⁷ These interview transcripts also constitute the empirical material for yet another article (in review) by me (Holmgren 2018).

The practice of found poetry originated in the early 20th century. Found poetry is created by combining words, phrases, or entire passages from one or multiple texts and framing the resulting text as poetry in the new context (Perloff 2012, 503). Found poetry, hereafter referred to as poetic condensation (see, e.g., Öhlen 2003; Hølge-Hazelton and Krøjer 2008). In the present article, poetic condensation denotes an active analytical en-

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

conducted interviews,9 or (3) as haiku formed10 reflections about scientific inquiry and poetry in general."

* * *

gagement with an empirical material where the result is poetic. The term thus functions as a noun (i.e., the final condensed product) as well as a verb (i.e., the act or process of condensing). For this type of poems—constructed using a compressed selection of the participant's or participants' exact words—Langer and Furman (2004) use the term research poems, Prendergast (2009, 545) labels them vox participare, whereas other researchers use different terms. In the present article, poems of this type are constructed of text from the places that the references indicate. In the extraction of passages or words, I have adhered to these six principles: (1) capitalisation has been removed, except for proper names and personal pronouns; (2) punctuation have been removed except for listening commas, quotation marks, and (one) question marks; (3) inserted words (or phrases) are printed within square brackets: [like this]; (4) references for respective utterance is given in the footnote placed at the end of that utterance; (5) italics and orthography are as in the original sources; and (6) some passages have been merged and some material rearranged in order to make the resulting poems less redundant. In addition, typographically, the second line resulting from line breaks of long lines has been indented approximately right-aligned.

For the second type of poems—in this text constructed by me as an analysis and representation of material from research interviews conducted by me-Prendergast uses the term vox autobiographia/autoethnographia, and describes them as written using "field notes, journal entries, or reflective/creative/autobiographical/autoethnographical writing as the data source" (2009, 545). I consider this type of poems to be an analysis and representation of the material, filtered through the researcher's understanding. Langer and Furman (2004, para 0) label a similar type of poems, attempting to capture "the essence of the subject's experience", as interpretive poems, whereas other researchers use different terms.

In this text, a haiku formed poem is viewed to have the three following characteristics: (1) it loosely adheres to the tradition of using a kigo (a seasonal word or phrase) seen in a

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

SCENE 2

RICHARDSON

interview tape-recorded transcribed cut pasted edited

trimmed smoothed snipped

standard conventions conceals the handprint of the researcher¹²

CH. If I read another interview study where the approach to transcription, translation, condensation, thematising, and analysis is not dealt with in depth, I will freak out.

RICHARDSON

texts are always subject to multiple readings¹³

CH. The postmodern stance gives me no comfort, nor does it persuade me. I wish I had become a linguist, philosopher, or programmer instead.

LEE

I switch hats visit the hat store

widened sense, i.e., something in the poem that relates to (the passing of) time; (2) it has a two-part structure—alluding to the traditional use of kireji (literary cutting characters)—that juxtaposes contrasting, explanatory, or humorous images (often themselves intended to be possible to interpret in many ways); and (3) it (mostly) adheres to the tradition of arranging the poems in three lines with five, seven, and five syllables respectively (see, e.g., Crowley 2012, 592–4, Johnson 2012, 594–5, and Morton 2012, 751–2).

- For the third type of poems—in this text constructed by me as free haiku formed reflections about scientific inquiry and poetry in general—Prendergast (2009, 545) uses the term *vox theoria*, and describes them as written as responses to literature or theory in a field, or about poetry or inquiry itself.
- 12 Richardson 2001, 878
- 13 Richardson 2001, 879

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

the sense of a hat unfolds who I want to be I play with the hats of my life¹⁴

CH. I need to be more pragmatic.

LEGGO

what is this poem good for?15

WITTGENSTEIN

one should write philosophy only as one writes a poem¹⁶

* * *

SCENE 3

NARRATOR. As an introduction before we get started, I would like to give the word to a character (i.e., another narrator) in the novel *The Loser* by Thomas Bernhard and let it present four concepts and one person that will eventually turn out to be quite significant in this autoethnodrama. These are: piano playing, philosophical matters, the competitiveness found both within art and research, the state of not knowing or understanding, and the classical pianist Glenn Gould.

BERNHARD

I would never have been able to play as well as

Glenn

for that reason I gave up from one moment to the next no more piano

¹⁴ Lee 2005b, 935

¹⁵ Leggo 2012, 143

¹⁶ Wittgenstein 1998, 28

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

I will now devote myself to philosophical

matters

even though I didn't have the faintest idea what these philosophical matters might be¹⁷

POETRY

förtviningsprocess: fortification:

inget mer pianospel no more piano playing snart är jag hemma soon I will be home¹⁸

LEGGO

my poetry is often personal autobiographical¹⁹

NARRATOR. Oh, one more thing. I might have forgotten to mention that during this autoethnodrama Poetry, as well as other voices, will comment here and there.

HIRSCH

poetry
a vague grouping of intrinsic genres
whose members do not share
any attribute or set of attributes
which distinguishes them from nonpoetry²⁰

LEGGO

I often wonder if anybody besides other poets really care about poetry²¹

¹⁷ Bernhard 1991, 11

As a service to the reader, the haiku formed poems are presented in both their English and original Swedish version (if there is any) for the possibility of comparison. For more information on the translation process see narration in act I, scene 5.

¹⁹ Leggo 2006, 85

²⁰ Hirsch 1967, 150

²¹ Leggo 2012, 143

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

ACTI

Where CH falls down some kind of rabbit hole through space and time, and reluctantly presents himself as an angst-ridden figure all too much reminding of a Don Quijotean–Feyerabendian–Gouldian tribrid, i.e., your ordinary (cup of) Joe.

SCENE 1

- CH. Firstly, I am delighted that you accepted my invitation to participate in this interview. I am sure that this will be an interesting conversation for both of us.
- Interpretation (Henceforth abbreviated to I). Thank you. It is nice to be here. Although, I must let you know that I am a little bit nervous. I am not used to being addressed face-to-face.
- CH. How come? Due to your quick reply, I got the impression that you did not mind talking.
- I. Not really. I am used to being spoken about rather than to, or with. Why that is the case, I can only speculate.

POETRY

interpretation interpretation

att ingen talar till mig no one ever talks to me

inte ens Hermes not even Hermes

TEACHERS

I wonder how often I say the word 'interpretation' probably quite seldom

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

NARRATOR. At this moment, I would like to add that the persons whose names are typographically approximatively centred (i.e., not left aligned) speak on verse within the internal dialogue of CH's mind. This means that the participants of the dialogue in prose spoken out loud—i.e., mainly CH and Interpretation (left aligned followed by a full stop)—hear and are influenced by the other voices but unable to engage in direct external communication with them. I would also like to remention that the empirical material for the poetic representations—presented as aggregates called Teachers respectively Students—are transcripts from the interviews conducted by CH with the piano teachers and students.²²

LEGGO

even while I look for interpretation I do not trust the interpreters²³

CH. What do you think?

- I. Sometimes it seems as if peoples' views about me are more interesting than what I am, do, or how I can be used to fulfil different humans' objectives. I find that tiring.
- CH. Personally, when I first made contact, I felt somewhat uncomfortable addressing you directly. Also, it quite frankly, made me question my mental health.
- I. Do you think that you should be worried about your mental health?

These interview transcripts also constitute the empirical material for yet another article (in review) by me (Holmgren 2018).

²³ Leggo 2018, 79

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

LEGGO

we need a healthy inner life this is where poetry can help²⁴

CH. I do not know, but I think that question is beyond the scope of this interview.

LEE

autoethnography an epiphany that heals deeper understanding²⁵

ROGERS

if I really understand I might be changed we all fear change²⁶

I. It was you who brought up the question, not me.

CH. Fair enough, getting back to the subject at hand ...

I. Pardon me for interrupting you, but just to clarify: when we read your ...

CH. We?

I. Yes, we. When we read your invitation and saw the preliminary title for this article, it was evident that you had to meet us all.

CH. Exactly whom am I talking to here?

I. Us.

CH. Who are you?

I. Musical interpretation, Theoretical framework, and Tool for analysis and representation.

²⁴ Leggo 2005, 446

²⁵ Lee 2006, 1154

²⁶ Rogers 1961, 18

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

MUSICAL INTERPRETATION. I, your old friend since the 1980s. However, strictly speaking, I am, or perhaps preferably, we are monozygotic twins: my sibling 'interpretation' (who is a noun) and myself 'to interpret' (who is a verb).

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK. I, your slightly newer (at least for you) philosophical—intellectual challenge.

TOOL FOR ANALYSIS AND REPRESENTATION. I, your postmodern (or am I only modern, who knows?) menace.

DAVIDSON

theory of interpretation the business jointly of the linguist, psychologist, and philosopher²⁷

* * *

SCENE 2

NARRATOR. While stopping briefly, to let CH regain his composure, different voices within his internal dialogue will articulate their views of the three aspects of interpretation. Let the characters representing Musical interpretation start.

TEACHERS

the short answer
to make a text come to life
that I can make comprehendible
within its limits
on an instrument
and relate to
with all that implies
and that responsibility

²⁷ Davidson 1984, 141-2

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

HIRSCH

the object of interpretation no automatic given a task that the interpreter sets decides what he wants to actualize and the purpose²⁸

STUDENTS

interpretation is when you work with something trying to understand what the dots mean

what does he really want which character what is it all about

one should sort out from marks and instructions says quite a lot but not really much much is between the lines

TEACHERS

can not interpret
without a lot behind you
you have to create a world
that you can operate within

eventually you acquire good taste to relate organically

²⁸ Hirsch 1967, 25

EJPAE: 01 2018 vol. 03 Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

if you do not music starts pulling faces

lesser geniuses as we must try to at least relate to the score and tradition

FEYERABEND

traditions neither good nor bad they simply are²⁹

TEACHERS

I admire interpreters like Alfred Brendel not that I at all compare me to him:

"over seventy
Mozart's sonatas for piano
if I do not understand them now
I do not really know when"

BRENDEL

if I belong to any tradition
it makes the masterpiece
tell the performer what he should do
not the performer telling the piece what it
should be like

²⁹ Feyerabend [1975] 1993, 268

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

or the composer what he ought to have

composed30

POETRY

May I present some short poems about musical interpretation?

RICHARDSON

to re-present significant moments the short poem a candid photo an episode an epiphany³¹ sequence narrative order implies a plot

the spaces invite response and interpretive work

artful openness by which we come to know and not to know and then to know ourselves again differently32

PRENDERGAST ET AL.

interviews the data research method haiku

Kidel 2001 30

Richardson 2001, 880

Richardson 2001, 881 32

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

results haiku poetry interpretation the poems³³

haiku excess of meanings constrained structure³⁴

free of clutter numerical obscurity

obfuscation³⁵

POETRY

The first poem below is participant-voiced, the second researcher-voiced,³⁶ whereas the third is a reflective poem:

tekniskt-musikaliskt music-technical

mindre genier som vi dwarfs standing on giants' shoulders

måste förhålla oss must behave oneself

likt en Odysseus like a Ulysses

kryssar Skylla–Karybdis beats Stretto di Messina god smak som sextant with acquired taste

500 sman som seneum with acquired tasse

tomhetens triumf the pain of wisdom

vet vad allting är utom knowing everything except

härledningen av hur how to deduce how

WITTGENSTEIN

refined taste has nothing to do

³³ Prendergast et al. 2009, 312

Prendergast et al. 2009, 312

³⁵ Prendergast et al. 2009, 312

For a broad idea of how the two first poems relate to the interview transcripts, see Teachers' second statement in this scene.

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

with creative power³⁷ taste rectifies³⁸

LATIN

Quod licet Iovi, non licet bovi.

ENGLISH

What is permissible for Jove is not permissible for a bull.

LEGGO

teachers should learn to know themselves as poets³⁹

米米米

SCENE 3

NARRATOR. After this presentation of Musical interpretation, it is time to let some voices representing Theoretical framework speak.

GADAMER

whoever has language "has" the world⁴⁰

LANGER AND FURMAN

language abstraction imperfect representation of human experience

Wittgenstein 1998, 68

³⁸ Wittgenstein 1998, 129

³⁹ Leggo 2005, 439 & 442

⁴⁰ Gadamer 2013, 469

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

researchers struggled to explore and communicate truths imperfect tool reducing human experience41

DAVIDSON

we do not know what someone means unless we know what he believes we do not know what one believes unless we know what he means42

TEACHERS

scientific research on interpretation measuring milliseconds a bit pointless

RICOEUR

reading like the execution of a musical score⁴³

PALMER

a musical score mere shell the "meaning" must be grasped to interpret⁴⁴

Langer and Furman 2004, para 1

⁴² Davidson 1984, 27

Ricoeur 1981, 121

⁴⁴ Palmer 1972, 16

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

interpretation: oral recitation reasonable explanation translation from another language⁴⁵

RICOEUR

to read is to consider its author already dead the book as posthumous

the relation complete and intact the author can no longer respond it only remains to read

his work⁴⁶

IRVIN

the authors choosing the works' features determine the interpretation⁴⁷

PALMER

integration the true task of hermeneutics⁴⁸

DAVEY

an interpretation of interpretation what "happens" to us when we are challenged

⁴⁵ Palmer 1972, 14

⁴⁶ Ricoeur 1981, 109

⁴⁷ Irvin 2015, 104

⁴⁸ Palmer 1972, 186

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

by texts and artworks ancient and modern⁴⁹

RICOEUR

to interpret to explicate the type of being-in-the-world unfolded *in front* of the text⁵⁰

WITTGENSTEIN

different 'interpretations' correspond to different applications⁵¹

STUDENTS

it is difficult to get it expressive in different

ways

when you have found one you always focus on recreating the same interpretation that you did before

RIBEIRO

that recording not the full range of possible interpretations even a parrot "declaim" differently each time⁵²

DAVEY

inability to arrive at a final interpretation⁵³ not residing in the quietness of a single interpretation upholds an openness

⁴⁹ Davey 2006, 1

⁵⁰ Ricoeur 2008, 82

⁵¹ Wittgenstein 1998, 46

⁵² Ribeiro 2015, 143

⁵³ Davey 2006, xv

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

translation transcendence furtherance of understanding⁵⁴

IRVIN

students almost never incorporate this seem to think that the goal is to eliminate confusion

to the extent that to feel confused is a sign of their own incompetence⁵⁵

BRENDEL.

nothing was further from my mind than a definitive solution I just plunged into an adventure⁵⁶ curator, executor, and obstetrician⁵⁷

HIRSCH each interpretive problem requires its own distinct context of relevant knowledge⁵⁸

the only methods advocated are those for weighing evidence⁵⁹

the question is not
"How are we to interpret the text?"
but "Which text are we to interpret?"

⁵⁴ Davey 2006, xvi

⁵⁵ Irvin 2015, 101

⁵⁶ Brendel [1966] 2015, 15

⁵⁷ Brendel [1970] 2015, 41

⁵⁸ Hirsch 1967, vii

⁵⁹ Hirsch 1967, x

⁶⁰ Hirsch 1967, 233

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

SCENE 4

NARRATOR. Finally, it is time to let voices representing Tool for analysis and representation speak. However, first, a short historical exposé presenting the development of arts-based research, focusing on the use of poetry and autoethnodrama.

SINNER ET AL.

1970s educational researchers practices of artists and critics arts-based forms were formulated

1990s arts-based research the creative arts inform and shape redefining methodological vehicles⁶¹

PELIAS

science looking at a tree and seeing lumber poetry looking at a tree and seeing a tree⁶²

LEAVY

poetry as research strategy

⁶¹ Sinner et al. 2006, 1226

⁶² Pelias 2004, 9

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

challenges

the fact-fiction dichotomy⁶³

HANAUER

normalization of data into academic prose illusion of disembodied objectified data⁶⁴

RICHARDSON

Nobody talks in prose.⁶⁵

PELIAS

sometimes using fiction to tell the truth⁶⁶

RICHARDSON

poetic representation convey meanings multiple and open

readings⁶⁷

HIRSCH

distinguishing characteristic of a text many disparate complexes of meaning can be construed

only by ignoring this can a theorist attempt to erect a normative principle⁶⁸

⁶³ Leavy 2015, 63

⁶⁴ Hanauer 2010, 91

Richardson 2001, 879

⁶⁶ Pelias 2004, 72

Richardson 1992, 126 67

⁶⁸ Hirsch 1967, 25

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

LEAVY

snippet of human experience in a heightened state⁶⁹ magnifying glass in front of reality⁷⁰

LANGER AND FURMAN

research poems condensed powerful forced to focus on

content and meaning subject's voice as primary transmitter⁷¹

FURMAN AND DILL only words and phrases found in the original data⁷²

interpretative poems

researcher poetry that they believe present themselves captures the essence fuses as a means of reflecting the subject on the relationship and between

the insights researcher of the researchers⁷³ and those being

researched⁷⁴

LEAVY

can be understood as an extension

⁶⁹ Leavy 2009, 64

⁷⁰ Leavy 2009, 68

⁷¹ Langer and Furman 2004, para 15 and 19

⁷² Furman and Dill 2015, 46

⁷³ Langer and Furman 2004, para 19

⁷⁴ Furman and Dill 2015, 46

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

of what they [qualitative researchers] already do⁷⁵

* * *

LEGGO

poetry act of transformation art of transformation minding and mining possibilities for translating the stories we live⁷⁶

swinging between knowing and not knowing writing in the air

like music

a ladder from here to there⁷⁷

researching autobiography asking unsettling questions learning to dream again to imagine other possibilities⁷⁸

LEE AND GOUZOUASIS autoethnographic duet dramatic and evocative account⁷⁹

⁷⁵ Leavy 2015, 64

⁷⁶ Leggo 2012, 142

Leggo 2012, 155 77

⁷⁸ Leggo 2004, 35

⁷⁹ Lee and Gouzouasis 2017, 316

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

GOUZOUASIS AND LEGGO

as we learn about music and poetry and the complex relationships we become more reflective learn new meanings of "that" which is meaningful to poets, musicians, and arts-based researchers we become pedagogical80

SALDANÃ

ethnodramatic representation should be chosen for its appropriateness81

analyzed and dramatized selections interview transcripts field notes written artifacts

characters the research participants⁸²

researcher's criteria don't always harmonize with an artist's theatre's primary goal is to entertain

ethnographic performance an entertainingly informative experience⁸³

⁸⁰ Gouzouasis and Leggo 2016, 462

Saldaña 2003, 218 81

⁸² Saldaña 2003, 218

Saldaña 2003, 220 83

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

dialogue characters exchange thoughts or an interpersonal conflict⁸⁴ the playwright's way of showing character interaction and interplay not only advance the action⁸⁵

Gouzouasis and Lee

emotional dialogue graduate supervisor and doctoral student the importance of providing support⁸⁶

LEGGO

read interrogate thematize expand summarize⁸⁷

show don't tell⁸⁸

RIBEIRO

poems in a typographic culture
wealth of possibilities of sound
minimized in silent reading
imagine if we learned to read musical scores
perfectly

and ceased to attend concerts⁸⁹

* * *

⁸⁴ Saldaña 2003, 225

⁸⁵ Saldaña 2003, 226

⁸⁶ Gouzouasis and Lee 2009, 173

⁸⁷ Leggo 2008, 6-7

⁸⁸ Leggo 2008, 11

⁸⁹ Ribeiro 2015, 147

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

SCENE 5

CH. Well ... all right then ... Sigh. It feels good to be a researcher with more ECTS credits than street cred.

ALMA MATER. ... at Luleå University of Technology!

I. May I propose that we get started? Our mutual friend Wirkungsgeschichte has suggested that it will not be long before we are in vogue yet again. You have to excuse us old concepts and words, but occasionally we need our beauty sleep.

CH. Okay.

TRANSLATION. Psst, I think it might be important to remind you all—homaging Grosseteste, Bacon et consortes—that this conversation is a translation ...

LATIN

Omnis traductor traditor.

ENGLISH

Every translator is a traitor.

KASPAREK

Roger Bacon[:]
the translator
must know both languages
as well as the science that he is to translate
finding that few have the requisite knowledge
he wanted to do away
with translation
and translators⁹⁰

FROST

poetry is that which is lost in translation

⁹⁰ Kasparek 1983, 85-6

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

any book in any but your own language or languages is a closed book⁹¹

DAVIDSON

what makes interpretation possible is the fact that we can dismiss a priori the chance of massive error92

ROBINSON

a translation and an original aptly analogous to a young writer and

a classic93

FROST

for self assurance there should always be a lingering

unhappiness

in reading translations94

ROBINSON

translational confidence can be sustained human situations are analogous95 shared reference points⁹⁶

that there can be no literal translation allows fidelity and accuracy these terms require an acknowledged gap⁹⁷

Frost 1973, 159 91

Davidson 1984, 169 92

Robinson 2009, 5 93

⁹⁴ Frost [1951] 2007, 167

Robinson 2009, 80 95

Robinson 2009, 92 96

Robinson 2009, 42

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

ontological ambiguity are and have to be read as the sound of one voice pretending to be another's⁹⁸

VENUTI

an interpretation that imitates yet varies foreign textual features in accordance with the translator's situation⁹⁹

limited by its address and intended function 100

ROBINSON

no clear distinction between a poem and a translation translation

what is produced is not the same it never is with any translation ¹⁰²

if you think the losses are worse with poetry than with the propositions of *Philosophical Investigations* could this be because you are reading

Wittgenstein inattentively?¹⁰³

translations like performances of scores always interpretive variations¹⁰⁴

⁹⁸ Robinson 2009, 50

⁹⁹ Venuti 2008, 124

¹⁰⁰ Venuti 2008, 14

¹⁰¹ Robinson 2009, 55

¹⁰² Robinson 2009, 58

¹⁰³ Robinson 2009, 58

¹⁰⁴ Robinson 2009, 68

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

fidelity may be evaluated and valued ¹⁰⁵ translations from experience are original poems ¹⁰⁶

MIDGLEY

data and interpretations shaped by weaknesses, choices, interests,

myths 107

ROBINSON

in writing trust requires
writer, text, and reader
in translation
writer, text, reader, translator, related text,
and reader.
and reader.

DAVIDSON

for speakers of the same language how can it be determined that the language is the same¹⁰⁹

TRANSCRIPTION.... in transcribed form.

Oliver, Serovich, and Mason social sciences frequently overlook $transcription^{{}^{\mathrm{IIO}}}$

¹⁰⁵ Robinson 2009, 73

¹⁰⁶ Robinson 2009, 173

¹⁰⁷ Midgley 2001, 141

¹⁰⁸ Robinson 2009, 156

¹⁰⁹ Davidson 1984, 125

¹¹⁰ Oliver, Serovich, and Mason 2005, 1275

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

NARRATOR. The following information should perhaps have been presented earlier. However, all interviews were carried out by CH in Swedish, although two of the participants had other mother tongues. The interviews were digitally recorded and transcribed verbatim by him. The transcripts passed through four stages of delicate editing—to remove stutterings and repetitions, inserting punctuation and capitalisation—before the participants got to approve of and had the opportunity to make additions, which no-one did, to their transcripts. The transcripts, consisting of in total 237 pages corresponding to about 12 hours of interviews, were read multiple times, and haiku formed researcher- as well as participant-voiced poems in Swedish were created. These poems were translated to—or more appropriately re-created (in a quasi-resurrecting sense) in—English either simultaneously or afterwards;

BRENDEL

already alive but dormant privilege of kissing her awake [again]¹¹¹

NARRATOR. this re-creation involved (at least) two different aspects, first a translation of the words in the poem, and second a translation into (relatively) tolerable and functional English. When the poems were created in Swedish, no concern was given the (potential) problem of later re-creating them in English. Some of the reflective poems were originally formulated in English and later re-created in Swedish. All translations were considered to be interpretive actions that affected the meaning and thereby the researcher could conceptualise anew, contributing to a new understanding of the material. The material in English is to be considered as a translation from the original Swedish, one that is written by a Swede, i.e., not in his mother tongue. The poems were checked for coherence and congruency with poetic condensations created for each transcript, and on

III Brendel 2013, 75

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

aggregated levels (one for teachers, and one for students). This check was simultaneously performed on the material in Swedish and English.

VENUTI

an interpretation made by the translator not necessarily open to every reader¹¹³

ROBINSON

use the limitations of translationese

as a means114

WITTGENSTEIN

strike a coin from every mistake"5

VENUTI

transparency conceals the translator's

interpretation 116

inscribes the foreign text with a partial

interpretation

excluding the very differences that translation

is called on to convey¹¹⁷

CH. I think I am about to give up.

I. Please don't. I kind of like talking to you. And you seem to be willing to listen to me.

NANCY

if someone listens to music without knowing anything about it without being capable of interpreting it

For a list of approaches to coherence and congruency see, e.g., Gouzouasis 2008, 224.

¹¹³ Venuti 2008, 266

¹¹⁴ Robinson 2009, 13

¹¹⁵ Wittgenstein 1998, 129

¹¹⁶ Venuti 2008, 66

¹¹⁷ Venuti 2008, 16

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

is it possible that he is actually listening to it rather than being reduced to hearing it 118

STUDENTS

a fantastic interpretation inside the head stays there

no one else gets to hear it

CH. It seems as if I hear too many voices or not enough. While my hubris is killing me, let's get to work.

I. What do you mean by 'work'?

* * *

SCENE 6

POETRY

jag undersöker I examine jag upphäver omdömet I determine in nothing

förföljd av alla now prosecutee

MONTAIGNE

J'essaie, tu essaies ...

ARISTOTLE

not the function of the poet to relate what has happened but what may happen what is possible

poetry more philosophical higher than history

¹¹⁸ Nancy 2007, 63

EJPAE: 01 2018 vol. 03 Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

express the universal history the particular ¹¹⁹

STUDENTS

could play a piece not like I really should not like the composer convincing the listener it should be like this although I am not doing as I really should

HIRSCH

too many interpreters have sought autobiographical meanings where none were meant 120

TEACHERS

some do things to appear as athwart sometimes fantastic sometimes causing motion sickness

original for the sake of originality not sure that music benefits

those who stand in front of Beethoven comes in the dark does things tries to over-interpret spotlight on oneself rather than on the material it can sometimes make me ill

¹¹⁹ Aristotle 1902, 35 120 Hirsch 1967, 16

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

very good pianists [sometimes] disturb rather than exposing drowned in subjective interpretation

GOULD

never be clever for the sake of being clever for the sake of showing off 121

TEACHERS

objections against Glenn Gould fantastic interpreter I do not listen to him

BRENDEL

Glenn Gould whose talent was exceptional whose style of dealing with his profession I found unacceptable 122

GADAMER

taste avoids the unusual the monstrous 123

Saldanā

ethnotheatre not intended as a "clever" presentation

medium124

¹²¹ Gould 1964

¹²² Brendel [2003] 2015, 429

¹²³ Gadamer 2013, 52

¹²⁴ Saldaña 2005, 2

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

ACT II

Where CH and Interpretation start talking, and Interpretation turns out to be a good but slightly annoying question asker.

SCENE 1

- I. So, tell me, why have you come to talk to us?
- CH. Well, you see, I am conducting music education research and want to understand more about the learning of musical interpretation within the context of one-to-one tuition in higher music education.
- I. That sounds interesting. What have you found so far?
- CH. It's complicated.
- I. Please, if you are going to talk to me, stop answering my questions with stock Face-book relationship statuses.
- CH. Okay. I have read quite a bit, interviewed students and teachers, watched piano lessons, conducted stimulated recall interviews, and of course done some thinking.
- L So?
- CH. At the moment I am trying to finish an article, whereof the autoethnodrama containing this interview constitutes the lion's share.
- I. What is the subject of that article?
- CH. I am trying to get to know Interpretation better through an investigation of musical interpretation, hermeneutics, and poetry as a tool for analysis and representation.
- I. How is that working out for you?

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

- CH. I do not really know. I am both dazed and confused, and quite frankly feel a little bit embarrassed.
- I. Why do you feel embarrassed?
- CH. Well, it sometimes feels as if I am trying to live up to some academic stereotype.
- I. How do you mean?
- CH. [reluctantly] Ahem. I will rip it off like a band-aid: I am afraid that my focus on theoretical frameworks, philosophical analyses, and definitions of terminology is a waste of time. A sort of procrastination instead of doing "real research".
- I. Have you learnt anything by doing this?
- CH. Yes, I suppose so.
- I. Good, so why worry?
- CH. I do not know. However, you see, reading Plato and Aristotle feels a little bit like reinventing the wheel ...
- I. Why?
- CH. It takes a lot of time, and my peers are conducting research and publishing studies while I am reading these old Greek philosophers.
- NARRATOR. Well, your grandfather—at least when it concerns your chosen theoretical framework—Gadamer mentions Plato on 124 pages and Aristotle on 98 pages in his bestselling 626 page long *Truth and Method* (2013). So I guess one could say that you are in good company, or try to present yourself as a thorough scholar through reinventing the square wheel.

WILSON

prevailing pragmatism situational imperatives "publish or perish"¹²⁵

¹²⁵ Wilson 1942, 197

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

NARRATOR. I find this quite meta; CH is trying to publish an article that—among other things—touches upon his fear of not publishing. In addition, this has already been done: see Redman-MacLaren's exploration including her fear of "non-production" and feelings of being an imposter, the latter area is also treated by Creps. 127

FEYERABEND

ideas are free publication is the problem¹²⁸

I. Don't you find Plato and Aristotle interesting? CH. Yes of course.

WHITEHEAD

safest general characterization European philosophical tradition consists of a series of footnotes to Plato¹²⁹

I. So then, what you are saying is that you feel the need to do more of less interesting things? Is that correct?

CH. I guess so.

- I. Why on earth did you pursue a career in your field of research if you feel like this? CH. I do not know.
- I. Maybe you need to start studying philosophy instead?
- CH. I am trying my best to conduct a systematic investigation, pursue wisdom, and cultivate my love of knowledge.

¹²⁶ Redman-MacLaren 2015

¹²⁷ Creps 2018

¹²⁸ Jung 2000, 160

¹²⁹ Whitehead [1929] 1978, 39

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

CAVELL

in the face of the questions posed we are

children

we do not know how to go on with them what ground we may occupy in this light

philosophy becomes the education

of grownups 130

I. What are your interests, besides talking to your fictitious creations?

CH. [rising in desperation] Gah. I am interested in doing scholarly work and learning stuff.

I. So then, is it not proper for you to read Plato and Aristotle?

CH. [pulling himself together in desperation] But it feels like everyone already has read Plato and Aristotle! It seems like, ahem, done.

I. But you say that your peers do not read him. You contradict yourself. Also, by the way, who are you to judge Plato and Aristotle?

CH. I am sorry. I did not intend to judge either of them. They are of course two essential philosophers.

I. Interpretation, yes?

CH. Yes.

I. ... well, you see. It's complicated.

CH. [stupent] Sigh.



¹³⁰ Cavell 1999, 224

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

SCENE 2

POETRY

searching for science into interpretation neither fish nor fowl

ARISTOTLE

the poet
like any other artist
must of necessity
imitate one of three objects
thing as they
were or are
are said or thought to be
ought to be

the vehicle is language current terms rare words or metaphors¹³¹

a command of metaphor is the mark of genius an eye for resemblances¹³²

ROBINSON

translation, interpretation, communication, and understanding extendedly metaphorical¹³³

¹³¹ Aristotle 1902, 97

¹³² Aristotle 1902, 87

¹³³ Robinson 2009, 101

EJPAE: 01 2018 vol. 03 Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

RICHARDSON

metaphor

backbone of social science

writing¹³⁴

¹³⁴ Richardson 1994, 519

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

ACT III

Where CH and Interpretation restart—or possibly reboot—the conversation and end it on a maybe slightly unexpected note.

SCENE 1

- I. How do you do. Please tell me your problem.
- CH. Where is this interview really going?
- I. Have you asked anyone else?
- CH. Have you answered any of my questions?
- I. Your questions?
- CH. Yes, regarding interpretation.
- I. I understand.
- CH. Okay, let us try it this way: I am sceptical of conducting arts-based research, but I am at the same time drawn to it.
- I. Is it because you are sceptical of conducting arts-based research that you came to me?
- CH. I do not know.
- I. Does that trouble you?
- CH. Yes, but at the same time, I am also sceptical to research in general.
- I. You are sure.
- CH. It makes me insecure.
- I. Tell me more about that.
- CH. Research is supposed to be at least sort of clear, but the more I try to find my cogito, ergo sum the more it seems that there is no firm ground.
- I. That is interesting. Please continue.

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

CH. I have so many questions and fear that I might be starting to think like a sophist.

I. That's quite interesting.

GOUZOUASIS

I hear the skepticism in their voices and that's a good thing.¹³⁵

ELIZA. Dear Interpretation, with all due respect I think that you have copied my interpretation of the DOCTOR script, and I want it back!

STUDENTS

before you have gotten any knowledge of interpretation you have to get different ways as long as you do not copy others'

interpretations

or you could do it

if you mimic it straight off you entirely pass up your own interpretation

TEACHERS

incredibly important not to [consciously] construct interpretations

not be a teacher who says do like this putting interpretations in the students' hand

¹³⁵ Gouzouasis 2008, 222

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

SHAW

honest and natural slum dialect more tolerable than the attempt to imitate the dialect of the golf club

imitation will only make them ridiculous 136

TEACHERS

have an opinion
I can tell you why it is not so good
and you can argue the opposite
about the person's interpretation
not how I
or one should play this piece
it is the student's way of saying I did not
understand that

BASIC INTERPRETER. ?SYNTAX ERROR

FEYERABEND

education
often consists in the teaching
of some basic myth
available in various versions
more advanced versions may be taught by
initiation rites

knowing the myth the grown-up can explain almost everything the myth guides his understanding¹³⁷

¹³⁶ Shaw 2003, 7

¹³⁷ Feyerabend 1981, 163

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

I. Goodbye. It was nice talking to you. P.S. I am your father, i.e., I am you.

HIGGINS

if I decide to teach you I'll be worse than two fathers¹³⁸

CH. I think that I am at a loss for words.

GOUZOUASIS AND LEE
Our dialogue sought coherence,
verisimilitude,
and interest. 139

Saldanā

I find myself offering each writer the same piece of advice:

"Stop thinking like a social scientist and start thinking like an artist." 140

* * *

SCENE 2

VAN FRAASSEN AND SIGMAN

science interpretation at two levels theory represents phenomena that representation itself subject to interpretation

¹³⁸ Shaw 2003, 28

¹³⁹ Gouzouasis and Lee 2002, 126

¹⁴⁰ Saldaña 2005, 33

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

as in art persons often unconscious of their interpretations and their responses as readers

the texts of science too are open texts¹⁴¹

HANAUER

but assumes the convention of trying to provide ease of access to its meanings 142

VAN FRAASSEN AND SIGMAN to enhance the understanding of science is not to resolve such ambiguity but to find out in how many different ways it could be resolved

every interpretation throw new light on the theory showing how the world could be

tensions created by ambiguity may well be the crucial clues to creative development¹⁴³

ARISTOTLE a probable impossibility

¹⁴¹ van Fraassen and Sigman 1993, 84

¹⁴² Hanauer 2010, 91

¹⁴³ van Fraassen and Sigman 1993, 92-3

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

preferred to a thing improbable and yet possible144

POETRY

I have a haiku about Boccaccio somewhere. Just give me a minute ...

Boccaccio tog Boccaccio took

alla geniala ord – all the ingenious words—

jag är bestulen I have been robbed

¹⁴⁴ Aristotle 1902, 107

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

ACT IV

Where CH has a brief conversation with the Critic that—having read the article—has a couple of questions and opinions of his own.

SCENE

- CRITIC (HENCEFORTH ABBREVIATED TO C). Firstly, I am delighted that you accepted my invitation to participate in this interview and talk about some of my questions concerning your article. I am sure that this will be an interesting conversation for both of us.
- CH. Thank you. It is nice to be here. Although, I must let you know that I am a little bit nervous. I am not used to being addressed face-to-face by critics.
- C. How come? Due to your quick reply, I got the impression that you did not mind answering questions or handling critique.
- CH. Not really. I am used to writing about things rather than speaking to, or with people. Why that is the case, I can only speculate.
- NARRATOR. [suspiciously] I hope that this autoethnodrama is not stuck on replay, because I have other research to narrate.
- C. Getting to des Pudels Kern, why did you write this elaborated autoethnodrama, created these poems, incorporated so many—what perhaps might be described as—learned quotes and so on?

GOUZOUASIS

narrative intended to teach potential wonders and powers of arts

in research

hermeneutic process in composing ABR

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

ways we can be inspired and changed by the processes how collaboration between musician and poet opens up possibilities for scholarly inquiry¹⁴⁵

HORACE

poetry both instruction and pleasure combine the *utile* with the *dulce*¹⁴⁶

SHAW

great art can never be anything else

[than didactic]¹⁴⁷

CH. My intention with this article was, in addition to trying to answer its aim and research questions, to experiment with the relationship between form and content in order to both understand different aspects of the subject as well as my relation to it.¹⁴⁸

RICHARDSON can/should only the tenured write experimental 149

C. With regards to your style of writing, why are you trying to be funny?

Saldanā

for the audience the central criterion

¹⁴⁵ Gouzouasis 2018, 235

¹⁴⁶ Horace [1926] 1929, 447

¹⁴⁷ Shaw 2003, 7

¹⁴⁸ see, e.g., Richardson 1994, 516

¹⁴⁹ Richardson 1994, 523

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

do I care what these characters have to say? the ultimate sin of theatre is to bore¹⁵⁰ theatre's primary goal is to entertain¹⁵¹

CH. I think that it is a sign of good health if you can view your privileged position as a researcher with some distance. Moreover, in the genre of autoethnodrama, amusing the audience can be a priority.

C. Okey, and what about you trying to be witty?

LEGGO

if you are going to be witty be prepared with a boy scout ethic to be misunderstood misinterpreted misrepresented (and not missed at all)¹⁵²

CH. I currently aim to write like authors of good children's literature do, i.e., produce text that is possible to interpret on many different levels.

RIVERA

Write in layers. 153

C. And what about your use of irony?

LEGGO

poetry thrives on irony, on juxtaposition,

incongruity

teaches us to trust and distrust

¹⁵⁰ Saldaña 2003, 227

¹⁵¹ Saldaña 2003, 220

¹⁵² Leggo 2018, 89

¹⁵³ Rivera 2003, 23

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

a Trickster-inspired hermeneutic that takes nothing for granted an agnostic's devotion to questions¹⁵⁴

CH. As a hermeneut, aspiring to the state of being a divine trickster (in a limited sense) comes with the package.

C. Hm. And what about your storyboard, or should I say stories in stories?

LEGGO

like Ukrainian stacking dolls or Chinese boxes a story inside a st

CH. I had not beforehand planned to place interviews and poetry inside an autoethnodrama. It happened quite organically during this inquiry as I became aware that the studied subject was rich, multifaceted, and contained different layers that had to be dealt with intertwined.

C. Why did you create an autoethnodrama to explore your topic?

SALDANA

qualitative methods theatre has been telling storytelling for more than 2,500 years writing and reporting and, more often than not, representing 156

CH. In the end, autoethnodrama seemed to fit the investigation conducted (as well as being a part of that investigation).

C. Okay. So, what have you found?

¹⁵⁴ Leggo 2018, 81

¹⁵⁵ Leggo 2008, 13

¹⁵⁶ Saldaña 2003, 230-1

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

- CH. That interpretation differs, albeit being constant; namely, any single interpretation—seen as a temporary solution to a particular problem at a specific time and place (with a specific audience in mind)—is never final or complete, and neither is knowledge about interpretation. More specific, the interpreter is seldom conducting Kuhnian puzzle-solving for Ariadne's thread. On second thought, that might not be the case; if we define the paradigm where the puzzle-solver is trying to solve the puzzle as the domain of the current artwork, the analogy might work.
- C. Fair enough, although not new knowledge for the knowledgeable. Moreover, what about that thing you in this research context call poetry, you seem to have been quite free (or should I perhaps better describe it as quasi-frivolous)?
- CH. That is correct. In the beginning, I was not comfortable in the use of poems or autoethnography. While creating the participant-voiced poems, however, it suddenly felt as everything was possible, and at the same time, I was not sure that I liked to have that freedom—or felt mature enough for the task. However, after a while, that fear seemed to be a cul-de-sac. The question at hand is instead if this freedom (if it is a freedom) can be used for good pur poses, with clearly stated intentions, transparency, and scientific rigour.
- C. What might your answers be to the questions that you have raised here?
- CH. Well, when it during the poetical condensation became possible to see the words for all the sentences, the meaning(s) of the text started to appear more clearly. At the same time, I nevertheless felt some similarity between my actions and those conducted by a particular Swedish politician who was suspected (however, freed in court) for having handed in manipulated representational receipts.

¹⁵⁷ see, e.g., Kuhn 2012, 65-78

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

POETRY

I have a poem about this:

orden stirrar likt lonesc höststorkarnas klapprande like th

är du Marjasin?

lonesome words staring like the last storks in autumn

are you Marjasin?

GADAMER RICHARDSON

one can often doubt A line
whether the division break
of lines still has does not

a true justification¹⁵⁸ a poem make.¹⁵⁹

C. So you felt a bit of unease, but so what? Do not all of us feel like that at times?

CH. That might be the case, but I felt a special obligation as I was supposed to be conducting research.

C. So? I thought you were all this Feyerabendian fellow?

CH. It turns out that it is one thing what you think in theory, but another is how you feel when you conduct your business. I like freedom in theory, but in practice, I tend to find truth and method—wherever that is to be found—more assuring.

GOETHE. May I suggest that you read something from my life instead, e.g., *Truth and Poetry*?

Poetry

I have a poem about this:

¹⁵⁸ Gadamer 1992, 74

¹⁵⁹ Richardson 2001, 882

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

självbestämmande my en skall det vara roligt att is it su

my empowerment is it supposed to be fun

utföra forskning to do science

KANT

happiness not from inclination but from duty¹⁶⁰

C. I am not sure that I entirely understand where you are going with all this. Did you like it—both the process and the results—or not?

RIVERA

Strive to be mysterious, not confusing.¹⁶¹

CH. To be honest, I think that it was my longing for scientific rigour that made me uneasy. Moreover, that might be due to me being drawn to positivistic beliefs. It is like a never-ending bad romance.

POETRY

As you might have guessed, I have a poem about it:

vetenskaplighet scholarly method

somnar som älskarinna woos you to sleep in her lap

vaknar som tyrann leaves you philistine

C. You seem to be quite open about your thoughts at least. So, tell me, is this so-called poetry of yours indeed poetry?

¹⁶⁰ Kant 2002, 15

¹⁶¹ Rivera 2003, 23

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

CH. I think that is a wrongly formulated question. The right question is instead if the poetry—and consequently the poet—makes something visible that otherwise would have been hidden.

LEGGO

what is this poem good for?162

WITTGENSTEIN

teaching to appreciate poetry can be part of an explanation of what music is 163

C. Do you think that?

CH. Yes, reluctantly so, but yes.

GADAMER

the question is not whether the poets are

silent

but whether our ear is acute enough to hear 164

POETRY

I have some final poems about this: 165

försöker skriva trying to write

något som liknar poesi something resembling poetry lurar jag någon? could I have fooled you?

¹⁶² Leggo 2012, 143

¹⁶³ Wittgenstein 1998, 81

¹⁶⁴ Gadamer 1992, 78

¹⁶⁵ See, e.g., Faulkner 2007 and 2009, Owton 2017, and Lafrenière and Cox 2012 for discussion of what constitutes (good enough) poetry in a research context.

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

upprört ropar man shouting with outrage detta är ingen haiku this is not a haiku Magritte-poesi Magritte poetry

C. I think that our time is running out. However, finally, who do you expect to read, understand, and have some kind of use for this article? Present company excluded, of course.

GOUZOUASIS

even the most seemingly abstract narrative form of research

such as this composition possesses an underlying structure many readers have difficulties interpreting the form 166

CH. Except for myself, I write for eternity. No, seriously, I think that those interested in embarking on a similar journey might find it interesting and useful in some quasi-Deweyan way. Others can perhaps find the presented, developed understanding of (musical) interpretation valuable.

RIVERA

In all your plays, be sure to write at least one impossible thing.

And don't let your director talk you out of it. 167

C. Has this type of writing not been done before?

CH. Autoethnodrama, poetic inquiry, arts-based research, as well as haiku and found poetry have most surely been used before. However, not intensively within

¹⁶⁶ Gouzouasis 2007, 38

¹⁶⁷ Rivera 2003, 23

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

music education research, and even less frequent within research focusing on the learning of musical interpretation.

C. Okay. Who would you say are your inspirations within your field of research?

CH. In the process of reading and writing, I got carried away and for a moment believed that the year was 1492 and that I had found America, i.e., I had not done enough reading. So, in hindsight, I found that I have some affinity with the works of Leggo, ¹⁶⁸ Lee, ¹⁶⁹ Gouzouasis, ¹⁷⁰ Prendergast, ¹⁷¹ and Furman ¹⁷² among others. Some specific concepts that others have inspired me to use are: (1) the use of poetry as literature review, ¹⁷³ (2) adapting the point of view of a theoretical framework; ¹⁷⁴ and (3) different aspects that were combined in the moulding of the autoethnodrama as a dialogue: interviewing an artwork, ¹⁷⁵ conducting self-interviews, ¹⁷⁶ and using the form of a dialogue ¹⁷⁷ including the Socratic method used in the dialogues of Plato.

Leggo do not stand on the shoulders of giants

¹⁶⁸ Leggo 2004, 2005, 2006, 2007, 2008, 2011, 2012, and 2018

¹⁶⁹ Lee 2005a, 2005b, 2005c, 2006, 2008a, 2008b, 2010, and Lee and Gouzouasis 2017.

¹⁷⁰ Gouzouasis and Lee 2002, Gouzouasis 2007 (interfolding theoretical analysis of a sonata form movement with dialogue, and including poetry on page 42), Gouzouasis 2008, Gouzouasis and Lee 2009, Gouzouasis and Leggo 2016, and Gouzouasis 2018

¹⁷¹ Prendergast 2004, 2006, 2009, and Prendergast et al. 2009

¹⁷² Langer and Furman 2004; Furman, Lietz, and Langer 2006; and Furman and Dill 2015

¹⁷³ Prendergast 2006 and Owton 2017, 85-102

¹⁷⁴ Sword 2012, 97

¹⁷⁵ Plagens 1986

¹⁷⁶ Gould [1972] 1990, [1974] 1990, and Vist 2006

Gouzouasis and Lee 2002, Gouzouasis and Leggo 2016, Gouzouasis 2008, Gouzouasis and Lee 2009, Lee and Gouzouasis 2017, Prendergast and Leggo 2007, and Gould's polyphonic radio documentaries *The Idea of North, The Latecomers*, and *The Quiet in the Land* (2007)

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

stand on the earth where they stood know they are still present¹⁷⁸

C. In what way?

LEGGO

an anarchic author heretic hermeneut jovial juggler narcissistic narrator playful pedagogue textual tease¹⁷⁹

- CH. I take pride in trying to question (at least almost) everything constructively. Also, sometimes applying a trickster-mentality, i.e., disobeying conventional rules, behaviours, and praxises could be beneficial to—and perhaps even necessary for—the production of new insights, meaning, and knowledge. Thus, I am only a disobeyer insofar as when I say what I believe to be true it is disobedient.
- C. Hm. Your last sentence rings like a Post-it-worthy "directive from that Peterson guy" 180 ...

RIVERA

Strive to be your own genre.¹⁸¹

C. ... so how do you expect the readers to understand your work?

CH. As an honest exercise in attempting to find a cogito for conducting arts-based research as well as to integrate different aspects of my personal history. However, different readers will find—and already have found—different interpretations.

¹⁷⁸ Leggo 2018, 82

¹⁷⁹ Leggo 2005, 453-4

¹⁸⁰ Hurwitz 2016, 107

¹⁸¹ Rivera 2003, 23

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

TEACHERS

interpretation what does it really say return and scrutinise

ROBINSON

it isn't possible to play the poem's notes

 $exactly^{{\scriptscriptstyle I}82}$

HIRSCH

textual meaning is not a naked given like a physical object¹⁸³

WITTGENSTEIN if you interpret in a shallow way the difficulty just remains¹⁸⁴

C. Finally, I must ask a question that has bothered me all the time. Who are Interpretation and the Critic actually?

CH. All of me, of course.

DUNN

a person who believes there's value in being overheard clarifying things for himself 185

POETRY. I think that you might be getting bored, but this is the last time—at least for now—that I am telling you that I have a poem about this or that:

¹⁸² Robinson 2009, 97

¹⁸³ Hirsch 1967, 210

¹⁸⁴ Wittgenstein 1998, 55

¹⁸⁵ Dunn 1993, ix

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

skriver min poesi writing poetry

som ett försök att lura as an attempt to deceive

livet och döden life and death

CH. Feci quod potui, faciant meliora potentes.

ENGLISH

I have done what I could: let those who can do more.

C. I agree, our work here is done. Mensch, jetzt machen wir doch endlich Feierabend!

FEYERABEND. My name is spelt "Feyerabend"!

GADAMER

interpretation is completed when the interpreter disappears only what one has interpreted is there an ideal always only achievable in approximation¹⁸⁶

RIVERA

Theatre is closer to poetry and music than it is to the novel.¹⁸⁷

BECKETT

ever failed ever tried

no matter

fail better¹⁸⁸ try again fail again

* * *

¹⁸⁶ Gadamer 1992, 76

¹⁸⁷ Rivera 2003, 22

¹⁸⁸ Beckett 1989, 101

within Music Education Research

Concluding reflections

WEIZENBAUM

it is said that to explain is to explain away wondrous ways sufficient to dazzle even the most experienced

once unmasked
its inner workings explained
in language sufficiently plain
to induce understanding
its magic crumbles away
revealed as a collection of procedures
each quite comprehensible

the observer says to himself
"I could have written that"
with that thought he moves [explanandum]
from the shelf marked "intelligent"
to that reserved for curios
fit to be discussed
only with people
less enlightened than he¹⁸⁹

The poetic condensation above centres on the explication of explanans and the potential consequences thereof for the appreciation of explanandum. However, Weizenbaum was neither a poet nor an arts-based researcher in music education—but a

¹⁸⁹ Weizenbaum 1966, 36

EJPAE: 01 2018 vol. 03

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

computer scientist, often seen as one of the early pioneers (and leading critics) within the field of artificial intelligence. ¹⁹⁰ In the following concluding section, I will reflect on the autoethnodrama in this article from the starting point of the poetic condensation above and its function as a potential clavis to unlock at least one of the possible interpretations of the drama. However, first, some background information about ELIZA, the computer program that the poetic condensation above dealt with, will follow.

In 1966 Weizenbaum wrote the computer program ELIZA at MIT. The program performed natural language processing and was driven by a script named DOC-TOR.191 ELIZA got its name after the working-class Cockney flower girl Eliza Doolittle, ingénue in Bernard Shaw's 1912 play Pygmalion (based on Ovid's narrative poem Metamorphoses, where the sculptor Pygmalion falls in love with a statue he had carved). In Pygmalion, Eliza asks Professor Henry Higgins for elocution lessons, i.e., the study of formal speaking in pronunciation, grammar, style, and tone. The gentleman Colonel Pickering makes a bet with Higgins and says that he will pay for the lessons if Higgins succeeds. Higgins, a character inspired by several professors of phonetics, is so sure of his abilities that he takes it upon himself to transform Eliza into someone who can pass for a cultured member of the society. Weizenbaum created the DOCTOR script to enable ELIZA to play-or with his own words "I should really say parody"192—a psychotherapist with a conversational style modelled after the American psychologist Carl Rogers's practice of using open-ended questions to improve patients communication with therapists. ELIZA applied pattern matching rules to the inputted statements to construct its replies, i.e., the practice now con-

¹⁹⁰ O'Reagan 2013, 263

¹⁹¹ Weizenbaum 1966, 36

¹⁹² Weizenbaum 1976, 3

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

ducted by so-called chatbots.¹⁹³ I propose that the above-mentioned aspects of ELIZA (including its theatrical ancestry) can be of use for understanding teaching and learning of musical interpretation, formulated as the following four metaphors on the topic of music education (research), which I will elaborate below:

- 1. the relation Eliza–Higgins as a metaphor for the relationship between student and teacher in one-to-one teaching within higher music education,
- 2. the relation ELIZA–DOCTOR as a metaphor for the teaching and learning of musical interpretation within higher music education,
- 3. the translation of the DOCTOR script from one language to another as a metaphor for the translation of pattern matching rules from one context to another,
- 4. the saying "it is said that to explain is to explain away" ¹⁹⁴ as a metaphor for the institutional practices within higher music education.

First, the relation Eliza–Higgins as a metaphor for the relationship between student and teacher in one-to-one teaching within higher music education: there is a distinct hierarchy concerning power and knowledge between student and teacher as well as between Eliza and Higgins. The hierarchy revolves around the wager formulated by Pickering (i.e., the public funding of higher music institutions, an analogy at least applicable in the Nordic countries) where he promises to pay for the lessons if Higgins succeeds. Higgins is so sure on his capacity to transform Eliza that he accepts. How-

¹⁹³ For an authentic example of a conversation with ELIZA see the beginning of act III, scene 1. The dialogue is between I (i.e., ELIZA interpreting the DOCTOR script) and CH until the (fictional) character named ELIZA interrupts and wants her interpretation back.

¹⁹⁴ Weizenbaum 1966, 36

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

ever, Weizenbaum noted that it was not clear whether ELIZA, as well as Eliza, became smarter or not through the tuition. Weizenbaum's description of ELIZA as an actress who commands "a set of techniques but who had nothing of her own to say" might also be food for thought. 196

The line of thought that I want to emphasise here is that public funding may give the false conception that higher education does not cost anything and that there might also be a job given to the student at the end (of the rainbow). In addition, this metaphor also highlights ethical aspects including the potential negative consequences if the relationship between student and teacher develops beyond their professional interests as in the play, as well as the question of how teachers view their former students' level of competence and agency. ¹⁹⁷

Second, the relation ELIZA–DOCTOR as a metaphor for the teaching and learning of musical interpretation within higher music education: ELIZA, driven by the DOCTOR script, converses in a style akin to a Rogerian therapist and thus asks open-ended questions. However, the program is designed to conceal its lack of understanding. Weizenbaum writes:

But to encourage its conversational partner to offer inputs from which it can select remedial information, it must reveal its misunderstanding. A switch of objectives from the concealment to the revelation of misunderstanding is seen

¹⁹⁵ Weizenbaum 1976, 188

¹⁹⁶ Weizenbaum 1976, 188

In *Pygmalion*, Higgins laughs at Liza when she says that she will teach what he taught her (Shaw 2003, 104). See also Shaw's elaboration of this passage in the section titled sequel (2003, 112–3).

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

as a precondition to making an ELIZA-like program the basis for an effective natural language and man-machine communication system. 198

The proposed movement from concealment to the revelation of misunderstandings resonates with Gadamer¹⁹⁹ for whom the interpreter's horizon is determinative and seen "as an opinion and a possibility that one brings into play and puts at risk, and that helps one truly to make one's own what the text says". This prerequisite is important for what Gadamer²⁰⁰ describes as the fusion of horizons, which "takes place in conversation, in which something is expressed that is not only mine or my author's, but common". This line of thought could be of interest for music education (research) focusing on the teaching and learning of interpretation as it highlights the importance of honest and real dialogues where both the student and the teacher are open and feel secure enough to put something at risk.201 In the form of a Petersonesque catchphrase: "to learn is to die voluntarily and be born again, in great ways and small",202 i.e., to intentionally take the heroic path (in an archetypal sense). 203 Thus, ELIZA-DOCTOR as a metaphor for the way musical interpretation is—or could be—taught and learned within higher music education is to mean that there is a potential for development if the script is developed. With this analogy, I do not mean to imply that the behaviour of teachers within higher music education is as non-refined as a computer program from the 1960s but to emphasise the importance of pedagogy within higher music education. (At this point, it might also be fruitful to revisit Rogers' outline of six necessary and sufficient conditions for therapeutic personality change to occur. The second of these is the client's "state of incongru-

¹⁹⁸ Weizenbaum 1966, 43

¹⁹⁹ Gadamer 2013, 390

²⁰⁰ Gadamer 2013, 390

²⁰¹ See also Rogers' statement in act I, scene 1.

²⁰² Peterson 2017 [58:18-58:23]

²⁰³ see Peterson 1999

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

ence",²⁰⁴ which in the context of music education could be understood as implying that the student has to know that something with his musical interpretation is problematic and has to change.)

Third, the translation of the DOCTOR script from one language to another as a metaphor for the translation of pattern matching rules from one context to another: in my teens, as a juvenile programmer, I translated the DOCTOR script from English to Swedish just for fun. When doing so, I noticed—as everyone within natural language processing already had known for a long time—that some translations worked better than others, whereas some gave entirely unacceptable results. The source code for ELIZA that I had access to was not well-commented, 205 and I lacked adequate knowledge of grammatical theory to be able to handle the differences between the two natural languages. As I did not make enough of an effort to understand the workings of the program, I could not solve the problem. (This was before the time where the Internet became widely accessible, so searching online was not an option.) This metaphor is meant to illustrate that even if an algorithm is written out in plain text, the translator still needs to have a clear conception of how the algorithm relates to the particular context if he is to produce a translation that results in acceptable results. Otherwise, it might be hard (or impossible) to accomplish that feat. In the context of learning of musical interpretation, this can manifest as a problem when the student does not understand how the particular interpretative rule relates to the musical language at hand. Consequently, the student will hardly be capable of successfully applying it to other musical contexts.

²⁰⁴ Rogers 1957, 96

The version of the source code for ELIZA that I used was written in ARexx, an implementation of the REXX (Restructured Extended Executor) language for the Amiga family of personal computers manufactured by Commodore from 1985 to 1996.

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

Fourth, the saying "it is said that to explain is to explain away" ²⁰⁶ as a metaphor for the institutional practices within higher music education: Lehmann et al. write that "some performers—similar to magicians—try to guard certain trade secrets and do not disclose all relevant details". ²⁰⁷ The researchers argue that performances depend on the performer's ability "to apply expressive rules" as they otherwise would be "overwhelmed by the demands of thousand arbitrary small differences". ²⁰⁸ As the performance rules become mastered they become automatic; consequently, performers are not necessarily aware that they use such rules. Lehmann et al. state that the experience of automaticity can "mislead the performer into believing that expression is truly intuitive and 'best not attended to.' "²⁰⁹ However, the process of interpretation should not be intuitive and unreflective: ²¹⁰

LEHMANN ET AL.

musicians

have nothing to fear from the scientific

assumption

human behavior concrete mechanisms in the brain

analyzing does nothing to blunt our sense of wonder

scientific experiences

²⁰⁶ Weizenbaum 1966, 36

²⁰⁷ Lehmann et al. 2006, 62

²⁰⁸ Lehmann et al. 2006, 101 & 103

²⁰⁹ Lehmann et al. 2006, 103

²¹⁰ see, e.g., Lehmann et al. 2006, 103

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

add layers of richness to our listening and performing²¹¹

In addition, I think that the point made by Lehmann et al. above in the poetic condensation is valid for the study of teachers, researchers, as well as for research in itself. In principle, I view it as impossible that increased understanding can be a bad thing in itself. Whereas, it has been shown time and again through history, that a little knowledge is a dangerous thing.

* * *

NARRATOR. P.S. I initially proposed to be called "What one has interpreted", but CH did not agree. Gee, I would have done almost anything to have that as a standing epithet. However, then again, who would not?

WITTGENSTEIN

he who understands me must throw away the ladder after he has climbed up on it²¹²

DAVIDSON

the methodology of interpretation nothing but epistemology seen in the mirror of meaning²¹³

²¹¹ Lehmann et al. 2006, 86

²¹² Wittgenstein 1990, sec. 6.54

²¹³ Davidson 1984, 169

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

POETRY. Finally, as it is stated in the abstract that CH finds a deeper understanding of his personhood, well, here it is as a "tightly organised albeit slightly Schubertian" coda, in the form of a nightly build of code poetry:²¹⁴

```
epilog(ue):- write('
       8 PRINT "TODAY I AM BEGINNING TO RESEARCH" : REM NEWLY BOUGHT COMMODORE C64
              ON THE REAR RACK OF MY CYAN COLOURED CRESCENT BIKE, ME SMILING IN 80S
              AVIATOR GLASSES
       rx "SAY ''Upgraded from 6581/8580 to Paula, Agnus, and Denise.''/* This
              morning, my daughter and I were listening to SID music and
              four channel modules.*/"
                                             [4 bombs]
       16 REM I TURNED TO MUSIC - IN THE COLD SPRING AIR, WITH MY SANCHO PANZA AND
              ES-5506 ("OTTO"), EVERYTHING SEEMED POSSIBLE
                                             [8 bombs]
                               Guru Meditation #8100000A.48454C50
       24 REM I WAS TURNED FROM MUSIC - FOUND TEMPORARY RELIEF IN HIGH PRESSURE
              (9 BARS)
       tell application "Microsoft Word" to quit 39 REM AT WORK WITH MY DAUGHTER, THE DISTINCTIVE SMELL OF POOR VENTILATION
              REMINDS ME OF CHILDHOOD VISITS TO MY PARENTS'' OFFICES
       \\immediate\\write18{\\unexpanded{test -e /Applications/x64.app || { curl -0
              https://netix.dl.sourceforge.net/project/vice-emu/releases/binaries/
              macosx/vice-macosx-sdl-x86\\_64-10.12-3.1.dmg; hdiutil attach vice-
              macosx-sdl-x86\\_64-10.12-3.1.dmg; cp -R /Volumes/vice-macosx-sdl-
              x86\\_64-10.12-3.1/x64.app /Applications; hdiutil detach
              / Volumes/vice-macosx-sdl-x86 \\ \\ -64-10.12-3.1; \ rm \ vice-macosx-sdl-x86 \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\
              _64-10.12-3.1.dmg; }; date +"\\\\Y" | xargs -I{}
/Applications/x64.app/Contents/MacOS/x64 -keybuf "{} goto 8\\\nrun\\
       % As I write this, I feel [d]izzy (suddenly remembering that my father used
to listen to "Salt Peanuts" on vinyl) and sweaty. The boy on line 8,
              where did he go? The daughter on line 39, will she ask the same
              questions in \theta \ (39-(\theta \) years? (Which
              strings will be attached to her loop [with or without the need for garbage collection]?) These pretzels are making me thirsty! (P.S. --
              shell-escape is needed.)
       42 PRINT "SUCCESS" : REM THIS PLACE WILL NEITHER THIS PROGRAM,
              INTERPRETATION, NOR I EVER REACH, I.E., OUTSIDE OF THE HERMENEUTIC
              CIRCLE. (ALL THE RUNNING YOU CAN DO IS NOT ENOUGH.)
author(grateful):- (makes('higgin''s_ending',money),\+ higgins(shot));
       article(read).
higgins(shot):- 'higgin''s_ending'(damnable), author(cranky).
:-epilog(ue).
```

LIZA. [getting off the ottoman] Youre not my teacher now. 215

For information on the use of computers or computer language in poetry see, e.g., Hartman 1996, Kockelman 2017, Simanowski 2011, and Johnston 2011.

²¹⁵ Shaw 2003, 102

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation

within Music Education Research

References

- Aristotle. 1902. *The Poetics of Aristotle*. Edited and translated by S. H. Butcher. 3rd rev. ed. London: Macmillan.
- Beckett, Samuel (1989). "Worstward Ho." In *Nohow on*, 101–28. London: John Calder.
- Bernhard, Thomas. 1991. *The Loser*. Translated by Jack Dawson. New York: Vintage Books.
- Brendel, Alfred. 2013. *A Pianist's A to Z: A Piano Lover's Reader*. Translated by Alfred Brendel and Michael Morley. London: Faber and Faber.
- ——. (1966) 2015. "Notes on a Complete Recording of Beethoven's Piano Works." In *Music, Sense and Nonsense: Collected Essays and Lectures*, 15–28. London: Robson press.
- ———. (1970) 2015. "Form and Psychology in Beethoven's Piano Sonatas." In *Music,* Sense and Nonsense: Collected Essays and Lectures, 41–55. London: Robson press.
- ———. (2003) 2015. "London Critics' Circle Award 2003." In *Music, Sense and Non*sense: Collected Essays and Lectures, 428–430. London: Robson press.
- Cavell, Stanley. 1999. Claim of Reason: Wittgenstein, Skepticism, Morality, and Tragedy. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Creps, Karenanna Boyle. 2018. "Get Published, Now: An Introduction to Qualitative Education Research." *Qualitative Inquiry* Prepublished March 29, 2018, DOI: 10.1177/1077800418767205
- Crowley, Cheryl A. 2012. "Haikai." In *The Princeton Encyclopedia of Poetry and Poetics*, edited by Roland Greene, Stephen Cushman, Clare Cavanagh, Jahan Ramazani, Paul F. Rouzer, Harris Feinsod, David Marno, and Alexandra Slessarev, 4th edition, 592–4. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

- EJPAE: 01 2018 vol. 03
- Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research
- Davey, Nicholas. 2006. *Unquiet Understanding: Gadamer's Philosophical Hermeneutics*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Davidson, Donald. 1984. *Inquiries into Truth and Interpretation*. Oxford: Clarendon.
- Dunn, Stephen. 1993. Walking Light: Essays and Memoirs. New York: W. W. Norton.
- Faulkner, Sandra L. 2007. "Concern With Craft: Using Ars Poetica as Criteria for Reading Research Poetry." *Qualitative Inquiry* 13 (2):218–34.
- Faulkner, Sandra L. 2009. *Poetry as Method: Reporting Research Through Verse.* London: Routledge.
- Feyerabend, Paul. (1975) 1993. Against Method: Outline of an Anarchistic Theory of Knowledge. 3rd rev. ed. London: Verso.
- ——. 1981. "How to Defend Society Against Science." In *Scientific Revolutions*, edited by Ian Hacking, 156–267. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Fraassen, Bas C. van, and Jill Sigman. 1993. "Interpretation in Science and the Arts." In *Realism and Representation: Essays on the Problem of Realism in Relation to Science, Literature and Culture*, edited by George Levine, 73–99. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.
- Frost, Robert. (1951) 2007. "Poetry and School." In *The Collected Prose of Robert Frost*, edited by Mark Richardson, 165–168. Cambridge, Massachusetts: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- ——. 1973. *Robert Frost on Writing*. Edited by Elaine Barry. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.
- Furman, Rich, and Cynthia Lietz, and Carol L. Langer. 2006. "The Research Poem in International Social Work: Innovations in Qualitative Methodology." *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 5 (3):1–8.
- Furman, Rich, and LeConté Dill. 2015. "Extreme Data Reduction: The Case for the Research Tanka." *Journal of Poetry Therapy* 28 (1):43–52.
- Gadamer, Hans-Georg. 1992. Hans-Georg Gadamer on Education, Poetry, and History: Applied Hermeneutics. Edited by Dieter Misgeld and Graeme Nich-

- olson. Translated by Lawrence Schmidt and Monica Reuss. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- ——. 2013. *Truth and Method*. Translation revised by Joel Weinsheimer and Donald G. Marshall. 2nd rev. ed. London: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Gould, Glenn. 1964. "So You Want to Write a Fugue?: For Four-Part Chorus of Mixed Voices with Piano Accompaniment." Milwaukee, Wisconsin: G. Schirmer.
- ———. (1972) 1990. "Glenn Gould Interviews Himself About Beethoven." In *The Glenn Gould Reader*, edited by Tim Page, 43–50. New York: Vintage Books.
- ———. (1974) 1990. "Glenn Gould Interviews Glenn Gould About Glenn Gould." In *The Glenn Gould Reader*, edited by Tim Page, 315–28. New York: Vintage Books.
- -----. 2007. Glenn Gould: The Radio Artist [5 CD Box Set]. CBC Records: PSCD 20315.
- Gouzouasis, Peter, and Karen V. Lee. 2002. "Do You Hear What I Hear? Musicians Composing the Truth." *Teacher Education Quarterly* 29 (4):125–41.
- Gouzouasis, Peter. 2007. "Music in an A/r/tographic Tonality." *Journal of the Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies* 5 (2):33–59.
- ——. 2008. "Toccata on Assessment, Validity and Interpretation." In *Being With* A/r/t/ography, 219–30. Rotterdam: SensePublishers.
- Gouzouasis, Peter, and Karen V. Lee. 2009. "The Cage: Stuff, Tunes and Tales." *Reflective Practice* 10 (2):173–8.
- Gouzouasis, Peter, and Carl Leggo. 2016. "Performative Research in Music and Poetry: An Intercultural Pedagogy of Listening." In: *The Routledge International Handbook of Intercultural Arts Research*, edited by Pamela Burnard, Elizabeth Mackinlay, and Kimberly Anne Powell, 454–66. London: Routledge.
- Gouzouasis, Peter. 2018. "A/r/tographic Inquiry in a New Tonality: The Relationality of Music and Poetry." In: *Handbook of Arts-Based Research*, edited by Patricia Leavy, 233–46. New York: The Guilford Press.

- EJPAE: 01 2018 vol. 03
- Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research
- Hanauer, David Ian. 2010. *Poetry as Research: Exploring Second Language Poetry Writing*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Hartman, Charles O. 1996. *Virtual Muse: Experiments in Computer Poetry*. Hanover: University Press of New England.
- Hirsch, Eric Donald. 1967. Validity in Interpretation. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Hølge-Hazelton, Bibi, and Jo Krøjer. 2008. "(Re)constructing Strategies: A Methodological Experiment on Representation." *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education* 21 (1):19–25.
- Holmgren, Carl. 2018. "Conditions for Piano Students' Development of Musical Interpretation in One-to-one Tuition Within Higher Music Education: An Interview Study with Students and Teachers." Unpublished manuscript, last modified 2018-05-01. Microsoft Word file. In the author's possession.
- Horace (1926) 1929. "Ars Poetica." In *Satires, Epistles and Ars Poetica*, rev. ed. translated by H. Rushton Fairclough, 442–89. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Hurwitz, Gregg. 2016. Orphan X. London: Michael Joseph.
- Irvin, Sherri. 2015. "Unreadable Poems and How They Mean." In *The Philosophy of Poetry*, edited by John Gibson, 88–110. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Johnson, Jeffrey. 2012. "Haiku, Western." In *The Princeton Encyclopedia of Poetry and Poetics*, edited by Roland Greene, Stephen Cushman, Clare Cavanagh, Jahan Ramazani, Paul F. Rouzer, Harris Feinsod, David Marno, and Alexandra Slessarev, 4th edition, 594–5. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Johnston, William David (Jhave). 2011. *Aesthetic Animism: Digital Poetry as Ontological Probe*. PhD thesis, Concordia University.
- Jung, Joachim. 2000. "Paul K. Feyerabend: Last Interview." In *The Worst Enemy of Science?: Essays in Memory of Paul Feyerabend*, edited by John Preston, Gonzalo Munévar, and David Lamb, 159–68. New York: Oxford University Press.

- EJPAE: 01 2018 vol. 03
- Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research
- Kant, Immanuel. 2002. *Groundwork for the Metaphysics of Morals*. Edited and translated by Allen W. Wood. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Kasparek, Christopher. 1983. "The Translator's Endless Toil." *The Polish Review* (28) 2:83-7.
- Kidel, Mark. *Alfred Brendel: Man and Mask*. TV documentary. Rosetta Pictures for the BBC and ZDF, in association with ARTE, 2000. Hilversum: Opus Arte, 2001. DVD. (Included in the compilation *Alfred Brendel in Portrait*)
- Kockelman, Paul. 2017. *The Art of Interpretation in the Age of Computation*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Kuhn, Thomas S. 2012. *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*. 4th ed. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Lafrenière, Darquise, and Susan M. Cox. 2012. "If You Can Call it a Poem': Toward a Framework for the Assessment of Arts-based Works." *Qualitative Research* 13(3):318–36.
- Langer, Carol, and Rich Furman. 2004. "Exploring Identity and Assimilation: Research and Interpretive Poems." [19 paragraphs] Forum: Qualitative Social Research 5 (2).
- Leavy, Patricia. 2009. *Method Meets Art: Arts-Based Research Practice*. New York: Guilford Press.
- ——. 2015. *Method Meets Art: Arts-Based Research Practice*. 2nd rev. ed. New York: The Guilford Press.
- Lee, Karen V. 2005a. "Joseph Santini: Divided I Stand." *Qualitative Inquiry* 11 (4):650–60.
- ------. 2005b. "Neuroticism: End of a Doctoral Dissertation." *Qualitative Inquiry* 11 (6):933-8.
- -----. 2005c. "Spoiled in Academia." *Qualitative Inquiry* 11 (6):939-40.
- ----. 2006. "A Fugue About Grief." Qualitative Inquiry 12 (6):1154-9.
- ——. 2008a. "A Neophyte About Online Teaching." *Qualitative Inquiry* 14 (7):1180–6.

- ——. 2008b. "White Whispers." *Qualitative Inquiry* 14 (6):896–900.
- ——. 2010. "An Autoethnography: Music Therapy after Laser Eye Surgery." *Qualitative Inquiry* 16 (4):244–8.
- Lee, Karen V., and Peter Gouzouasis. 2017. "Tommy's Tune: Autoethnographic Duet." *Qualitative Inquiry* 23 (4):316–20.
- Leggo, Carl. 2004. "The Curriculum of Joy: Six Poetic Ruminations." *Journal of the Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies* 2 (2):27–42.
- -----. 2005. "The Heart of Pedagogy: On Poetic Knowing and Living." *Teachers and Teaching* 11 (5):439–55.
- ——. 2006. "End of the Line: A Poet's Postmodern Musings on Writing." *English Teaching: Practice and Critique* 5 (2):69–92.
- -----. 2007. "The Syntax of Silence." *Journal of Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies* 5 (1): 94–101.
- -----. 2008. "Narrative Inquiry: Attending to the Art of Discourse." *Language and Literacy* 10 (1):1–21.
- -----. 2011. "Living Love: Confessions of a Fearful Teacher." *Journal of Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies* 9 (1):115-44.
- ——. 2012. "Living Language: What Is a Poem Good For?" *Journal of Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies* 10 (1):141–60.
- -----. 2018. "Poetry in the Academy: A Language of Possibility." *Canadian Journal of Education* 41 (1):69–97.
- Lehmann, Andreas C, John A. Sloboda, and Robert H. Woody. 2006. *Psychology for Musicians: Understanding and Acquiring the Skills*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Midgley, Mary. 2001. Science and Poetry. London: Routledge.
- Morton, Leith. 2012. "Japan, Modern poetry of." In *The Princeton Encyclopedia of Poetry and Poetics*, edited by Roland Greene, Stephen Cushman, Clare Cavanagh, Jahan Ramazani, Paul F. Rouzer, Harris Feinsod, David Marno, and Alexandra Slessarev, 4th edition, 750–4. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

- EJPAE: 01 2018 vol. 03
- Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research
- Nancy, Jean-Luc. 2007. *Listening*. Translated by Charlotte Mandell. New York: Fordham University Press.
- Öhlen, Joakim. 2003. "Evocation of Meaning Through Poetic Condensation of Narratives in Empirical Phenomenological Inquiry Into Human Suffering." Qualitative Health Research 13 (4):557–66.
- Oliver, Daniel G., Julianne M. Serovich, and Tina L. Mason. 2005. "Constraints and Opportunities with Interview Transcription: Towards Reflection in Qualitative Research." *Social Forces* 84 (2):1273–89.
- O'Reagan, Gerard. 2013. "Joseph Weizenbaum." In *Giants of Computing: A Compendium of Select, Pivotal Pioneers*, 263–6. Springer: London.
- Owton, Helen. 2017. Doing Poetic Inquiry. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Palmer, Richard E. 1972. Hermeneutics: Interpretation Theory in Schleiermacher, Dilthey, Heidegger, and Gadamer. Evanston: Northwestern University Press.
- Pelias, Ronald J. 2004. A Methodology of the Heart: Evoking Academic and Daily Life. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.
- Perloff, Marjorie. 2012. "Found poetry." In *The Princeton Encyclopedia of Poetry and Poetics*, edited by Roland Greene, Stephen Cushman, Clare Cavanagh, Jahan Ramazani, Paul F. Rouzer, Harris Feinsod, David Marno, and Alexandra Slessarev, 4th edition, 503–4. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Peterson, Jordan B. 1999. Maps of Meaning: The Architecture of Belief. London: Routledge.
- Plagens, Peter. 1986. "Conversation with a Work of Art." In *Moonlight Blues: An Artist's Art Criticism*, edited by Peter Plagens, 255–62. Ann Arbor, Michigan: UMI Research Press.
- Prendergast, Monica. 2004. "Shaped Like a Question Mark': Found Poetry from Herbert Blau's the Audience." *Research in Drama Education: The Journal of Applied Theatre and Performance* 9 (1):73–92.

- ——. 2006. "Found Poetry as Literature Review: Research Poems on Audience and Performance." *Qualitative Inquiry* 12 (2):369–88.
- Prendergast, Monica, and Carl Leggo. 2007. "Interlude: Astonishing Wonder: Spirituality and Poetry in Educational Research." In *International Handbook of Research in Arts Education*, edited by Liora Bresler, 1459–77. Dordrecht: Springer.
- Prendergast, Monica. 2009. "Poem Is What?' Poetic Inquiry in Qualitative Social Science Research." *International Review of Qualitative Research* 1 (4):541–568.
- Prendergast, Monica, Peter Gouzouasis, Carl Leggo, and Rita L. Irwin. 2009. "A Haiku Suite: The Importance of Music Making in the Lives of Secondary School Students." *Music Education Research* 11 (3):303–17.
- Redman-MacLaren, Michelle. 2015. "Becoming a Researcher: An Auto-ethnographic Account of a Doctoral Researcher Re-presented in Poetry." *Journal of Poetry Therapy* 28 (3):207–14.
- Ribeiro, Anna Christina Soy. 2015. "The Spoken and the Written: An Ontology of Poems." In *The Philosophy of Poetry*, edited by John Gibson, 127–48. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Richardson, Laurel. 1992. "The Consequences of Poetic Representation: Writing the Other, Rewriting the Self." In *Investigating Subjectivity: Research on Lived Experience*, edited by Carolyn Ellis and Michael G. Flaherty, 125–37. Newbury Park: Sage.
- ——. 1994. "Writing: A Method of Inquiry." In *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, edited by Norman K. Denzin and Yonna S. Lincoln, 516–29. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- ——. 2001. "Poetic Representations of Interviews." In *Handbook of Interview Research*, 1st ed. by Jaber F. Gubrium and James A. Holstein, 877–91.
- Ricoeur, Paul. 1981. Hermeneutics and the Human Sciences: Essays on Language, Action and Interpretation. Edited and translated by John B. Thompson. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- ——. 2008. From Text to Action: Essays in Hermeneutics, II. Translated by Kathleen Blamey and John B. Thompson. London: Continuum.
- Rivera, José. 2003. "36 Assumptions About Writing Plays." *American Theatre* 20(2):22–3.
- Robinson, Peter. 2009. *Poetry and Translation: The Art of the Impossible*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press.
- Rogers, Carl R. 1957. "The Necessary and Sufficient Conditions of Therapeutic Personality Change." *Journal of Consulting Psychology*, 21(2): 95–103.
- ——. 1961. On Becoming a Person: A Therapist's View of Psychotherapy. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Saldaña, Johnny. 2003. "Dramatizing Data: A Primer." *Qualitative Inquiry* 9 (2):218–36.
- ——. 2005. "An Introduction to Ethnodrama." In Ethnodrama: An Anthology of Reality Theatre, edited by Johnny Saldaña, 1–36. Walnut Creek: AltaMira Press.
- ——. 2008. "Ethnodrama." In *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods Volume 1*, edited by Lisa M. Given, 283–5. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Shaw, Bernard. 2003. *Pygmalion: A Romance in Five Acts.* Edited by Dan H. Laurence with introduction by Nicholas Grene. London: Penguin Books.
- Simanowski, Roberto. 2011. *Digital Art and Meaning: Reading Kinetic Poetry, Text Machines, Mapping Art, and Interactive Installations*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Sinner, Anita, Carl Leggo, Rita L. Irwin, Peter Gouzouasis, and Kit Grauer. 2006. "Arts-Based Educational Research Dissertations: Reviewing the Practices of New Scholars." *Canadian Journal of Education* 29 (4):1223–70.
- Sword, Helen. 2012. *Stylish Academic Writing*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Venuti, Lawrence. 2008. *The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation*. 2nd ed. London: Routledge.

Holmgren; A Philosophic Poetic Inquiry of Three Aspects of Interpretation within Music Education Research

- Vist, Torill. 2006. "Self Interview: Relevance in Research?" In *Flerstemmige innspill* 2006: En artikkelsamling, edited by Øivind Varkøy, Siw G. Nielsen, and Bjørg J. Bjøntegaard, 83–91. Oslo: NMH-publikasjoner.
- Weizenbaum, Joseph. 1966. "ELIZA: A Computer Program for the Study of Natural Language Communication Between Man and Machine." *Communications of the ACM* 9 (1):36–45.
- ——. 1976. Computer Power and Human Reason: From Judgment to Calculation. San Francisco: W. H. Freeman and Company.
- Whitehead, Alfred North. (1929) 1978. *Process and Reality: An Essay in Cosmology*. Edited by David Ray Griffin and Donald W. Sherburne. Corrected ed. New York: Free Press.
- Wilson, Logan. 1942. *The Academic Man: A Study in the Sociology of a Profession*. London: Oxford University Press.
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig. 1990. *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*. Translated by C. K. Ogden. London: Routledge.
- ——. 1998. Culture and Value: A Selection from the Posthumous Remains. Edited by Georg Henrik von Wright, Heikki Nyman, and Alois Pichler. Translated by Peter Winch. 2nd rev ed. Oxford: Blackwell.

About the Author

Carl Holmgren is a PhD student in music education at Luleå University of Technology. He received his master of education in music and master of music from ditto university. Previously, Holmgren taught a variety of subjects there, including piano playing, piano methods, and music theory. For more than a decade, he also accompanied ballet lessons. Earlier versions of this article were presented at Nordic Network for Research in Music Education and the Swedish Music Research Conference. Holmgren's research interests centre on teaching and learning of musical interpretation in higher education, hermeneutics, languages, translation, and poetry. He currently intermittently lectures at second cycle degree programmes.